KEY ATTRIBUTES OF LC MENTORS

JIM WAGNER, MD
UT SOUTHWESTERN
LCI ANNUAL MEETING, 11/11/2016
MEDICAL LEARNING COMMUNITIES: A MODEL

- Faculty
- Students
- Doctors
- School Attributes
- LC Attributes
- Mentor Attributes: Skills, Knowledge, Attitudes
- External Factors: LCME, Society

Medical School
THIS STUDY’S FOCUS

Mentor Attributes: Skills, Knowledge, Attitudes

External Factors: LCME, Society

LC Attributes

Faculty

Students

Doctors
MENTORING ATTRIBUTES IN THE MANAGEMENT LITERATURE

CAREER FUNCTIONS
- Sponsorship
- Exposure and Visibility
- Coaching
- Protection
- Challenging Assignments

PSYCHOSOCIAL FUNCTIONS
- Role Modeling
- Acceptance and Confirmation
- Counseling
- Friendship

QUALITATIVE METHODS: DATA COLLECTION

• N = 50 mentors
  • Inexperienced = 19 mentors (2 groups)
  • Experienced = 31 mentors (4 groups)

• 6 focus groups, 90 minutes, 2 facilitators, 4 questions:
  1. What are the essential, observable elements of an excellent Colleges mentor?
  2. When do you think these elements should be shared with/taught to new mentors? Experienced mentors?
  3. Should these elements be assessed in new mentors? Experienced mentors?
  4. If these elements should be assessed, when and how often?
QUALITATIVE METHODS: DATA ANALYSIS

• Discussions were recorded and transcribed

• Thematic analysis using ATLAS.ti
  • Identification of themes (JW)
  • Coding of passages (WH & TG)
    • Inter-rater reliability: Kappa ranged from 0.85 to 1.0 (mean 0.93)
  • Analysis for subthemes (JW)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Mentors Characteristics/Competency</th>
<th>Suggested Faculty Development Methods</th>
<th>External Factors Influencing Relationship with Students</th>
<th>Student Attributes Requiring Adaptive Teaching Techniques</th>
<th>Measuring and Improving H&amp;P Skills</th>
<th>Small Group Facilitation Skills</th>
<th>Accessibility</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Over 50% of passages addressed these themes: subthemes were explored

Less than 5% of passages addressed this theme: it was dropped

Other themes overlapped with this theme: it was dropped
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme (Subtheme indented)</th>
<th>Experienced Mentors</th>
<th>Inexperienced Mentors</th>
<th>TOTALS:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
<td>Column %</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Mentor Characteristics/Competency</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.a. Teaching Competence</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.b. Relationship Competence</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.c. Mentor Clinical Competence</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Suggested Faculty Development Methods</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.a. Assess and Give Feedback</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.b. Peer Mentoring</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.c. Learn From Experts</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. External Factors Influencing Relationship with Students</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Student Attributes Influencing Teaching Techniques</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Measuring and Improving H&amp;P Skills</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTALS:</td>
<td>852</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
RESULTS: THEME 1 AND SUBTHEMES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme (Subtheme indented)</th>
<th>Experienced Mentors</th>
<th>Inexperienced Mentors</th>
<th>TOTALS:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
<td>Column %</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Mentor Characteristics/Competency</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.a. Teaching Competence</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.b. Relationship Competence</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.c. Mentor Clinical Competence</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTALS:</td>
<td>785</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Discussed more commonly among Experienced Mentors: Lessons Learned?
THEME 1: MENTOR CHARACTERISTIC
SUBTHEME 1A: RELATIONSHIP COMPETENCE

• “They need to care about the group. They need to care about each individual person and their growth as a person and professional equally.”
THEME 1: MENTOR CHARACTERISTIC
SUBTHEME 1A: RELATIONSHIP COMPETENCE

• “... you can talk to them. Sometimes they may not be able to share certain things about their growth. So having a group, having 1-on-1 sessions ... how is med school and things? or how are they doing? ... that helps them a lot. And they open up a lot more, and you’ll be surprised at what you hear during those sessions.”
THEME 1: MENTOR CHARACTERISTIC
SUBTHEME 1A: RELATIONSHIP COMPETENCE

• “Emotional inclusion ... being in tune and detect what is going on in people.”
THEME 1: MENTOR CHARACTERISTIC
SUBTHEME 1B: TEACHING COMPETENCE

• “You gotta be able to facilitate a good group discussion amongst the students, it's a key thing especially for a lot of ethics modules and so on.”
THEME 1: MENTOR CHARACTERISTIC
SUBTHEME 1B: TEACHING COMPETENCE

• “... some of the best mentors are people who get out of the way of the good students and gravitate towards students who are having a little trouble, who need a little more help.”
THEME 1: MENTOR CHARACTERISTIC
SUBTHEME 1B: TEACHING COMPETENCE

• “To be able to bring students from disparate backgrounds, goals and life, and to work together in a consistent and efficient way.”
## RESULTS: THEME 2 AND SUBTHEMES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme (Subtheme indented)</th>
<th>Experienced Mentors</th>
<th>Inexperienced Mentors</th>
<th>TOTALS:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Column n</td>
<td>Column %</td>
<td>Column n</td>
<td>Column %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Suggested Faculty Development Methods</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.a. Assess and Give Feedback</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.b. Peer Mentoring</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.c. Learn From Experts</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>...</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTALS:</td>
<td>785</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
THEME 2: FACULTY DEVELOPMENT SUGGESTION:
SUBTHEME 2A: ASSESS AND GIVE FEEDBACK

• “[Mentors] should be assessed. New and old, I’m sorry experienced not old. I mean the more feedback the better. … You get feedback and you want to improve. I mean I’m looking at these forms and I’m seeing definite room for improvement and I would’ve liked to have had more feedback.”
THEME 2: FACULTY DEVELOPMENT SUGGESTION: SUBTHEME 2A: ASSESS AND GIVE FEEDBACK

“... if I walk in and I’m expected to be a mentor, the question is, what do my students expect of me? What are the skills that I’m expected to bring to the table? And whatever those expectations are, clearly I don’t come supplied with every one of them. You have to teach me ... And hone them as time goes by.”
THEME 2: FACULTY DEVELOPMENT SUGGESTION: SUBTHEME 2B: PEER MENTORING

• “... we have some great strengths in the colleges, but I don’t know that we share them as well as we should. And I think it would help all mentors ... if we could identify people ... kind of what are best practices of teaching things in a very granular way.”
THEME 2: FACULTY DEVELOPMENT SUGGESTION:
SUBTHEME 2B: PEER MENTORING

• “... you could have a buddy mentor, and so you could have a more experienced person with a new person or different specialties ...”
THEME 2: FACULTY DEVELOPMENT SUGGESTION: SUBTHEME 2C: LEARN FROM EXPERTS

• “It’d be great if we were taught some of these theories, so we understand what to do when we stumble and fall and can’t quite figure out where we messed up. What are the steps? Where do we start? Where are the theoretical bases of what we are going to do next?”
THEME 2: FACULTY DEVELOPMENT SUGGESTION:
SUBTHEME 2C: LEARN FROM EXPERTS

• “... if you’re going to teach the neuro exam today, here’s some key points to focus in on. You know if you are not going to have a neurologist come to the room, it might not be a bad idea to recruit ... somebody to come in and ... go over it with them.”
CONCLUSIONS: KEY ATTRIBUTES OF MENTORS

1. Three subthemes of the most prevalent theme - “competencies” of medical learning community mentors:
   - Relationship Competence
   - Teaching Competence
   - Clinical Competence

Mentors learn the importance of these competencies with experience.
### MENTORING MODELS: OVERLAP EXISTS

#### This Study
- Clinical Competence
- Relationship Competence
- Teaching Competence

#### General Mentoring Functions
- Career Functions
- Psychosocial Functions

#### Pedagogical Content Knowledge
- Knowledge of Content
- Knowledge of Learners
- Knowledge of Pedagogy & Context

---

CONCLUSIONS

2. Teaching Competence seems to be an added dimension of mentoring attributes in the context of Medical Learning Communities
   a) Mentoring in this context has explicit teaching function
   b) Mentoring is with a group, rather than the traditional 1:1
CONCLUSIONS

3. Faculty development felt by mentors to be most useful should include:
   a) Objective assessment of and feedback to mentors
   b) Peer mentoring/sharing best practices
   c) Learning from experts
SPECIAL THANKS

- Troy Gurney
- Waqas Haque
- Gary Reed, MD, Headmaster of Colleges
- Carol North, MD
- David Pollio, MSW, PhD